

An Analysis of Corporal Punishment In The Light Of the Holy Quran and Hadith

Dr Muhammad Ishaqⁱ

Dr Jehangir Shahⁱⁱ

Abstract

The overall purpose of the study was to investigate the causes and effects of corporal punishment, to analyze corporal punishment in the light of hadith and the Holy Quran and to suggest some workable plan for minimizing this social problem. Forty government schools were selected randomly as sample. Boys' and girls' student ratio was 67:33 of the sample. Three students each from 6th, 7th and 8th class and three teachers were taken randomly from each school. For data collection two questionnaires, one for students and another for teachers were designed. Majority of the students and teachers stated that corporal punishment is given for maintaining discipline and for incomplete home assignments which are the sign of fear and most of the students remain absent from the school or say goodbye to the school.

The education department may have clear policy on corporal punishment because in the absence of corporal punishment one cannot achieve the desired objectives. Light punishment may be awarded for the sake of improvement for to hurt.

Key Words: *Corporal punishment, The Holy Quran, Hadith, elementary, Peshawar*

Introduction

Punishment means to administer the Justice within the limits of a school or state. Corporal punishment is the intentional Infliction of pain and distress intended to punish a person to change his/her behavior. Most of corporal punishment was used in legal, domestic, or in educational setting. Corporal punishment in school used to maintain discipline in Educational institutions. Discipline involves the habituation or molding of conduct, by applying rewards or by grueling the wrong doers. Discipline in school means regularity, punctuality and to obey rules and regulation. A cure corporal punishment is also cure for students if they forget their homework, go against school rules, thus corporal punishment is used to achieve the goals and through this the boy or girl may be stopped from telling a lies

ⁱ *Assistant Professor, Islamia College Peshawar*

ⁱⁱ *Assistant Professor, Islamia College Peshawar*

but he or she will not love the truth and will have to obey the rules and regulation of educational institutions.

“Corporal punishment is the use of bodily force deliberate to cause some degree of pain or discomfort for obedience, correction and control changing activities or in the belief of educating / bringing up the child.” (Save the Children April, 2003)

“Corporal punishment is punishment in which physical force is intended to cause some degree of pain or discomfort, by beating children with sticks or with slap or pulling ears.” (A study by UNICEF, 2005)

Corporal punishment is bodily reprimand which is used to achieve the goals either in schools, or for maintaining rule and regulation in country. Corporal punishment is a control method in which a supervising adult intentionally inflicts pain upon a child in response to a child’s undesirable behavior and or inappropriate language. The urgent aims of such punishment are usually to stop the offense, prevent its repetition and set an example for others. The supposed long-term goal is to change the child’s behavior and to make it more regular with the adult’s hope. In corporal punishment, the adult usually hits different parts of the child’s body with a hand, or with canes, paddles, yardsticks, belts, or other objects probable to cause pain and fear furthermore, some people say that corporal punishment is a useless means of discipline, because the same students are constantly the recipients of it. Corporal punishment does not teach a child suitable behavior, but only suppresses the unwanted behavior when the child perceives the punisher as being close.

Physical punishment may make respect in the short term, but continued over time it tends to increase the possibility of violent behavior during childhood and maturity

“Spare the rod and spoil the child”

His poem “The Way of All Flesh” was written to expose and denounce violence against children. (Samuel Butler, 1903)

Types of corporal punishment

Corporal punishment goes by a range of names but not limited to beating, hitting, spanking, paddling, swatting and canning. Beating with sticks or cane, Slapping on the face, head, at the back, Child stands on one foot and stretches his arms up, Child stands on a bench, facing the class, Asking two

students to constantly spank each other on face, Kicking the victim, Punching with hand, Pulling the ears, Pulling the hairs, Pinching the child, Standing in the hot sun, Forcing to kneel down, Pushing and shacking, Blowing, Continuous running in the school compound, Sit-stand, Rooster, Twisting pencil, Expelling from class, Shouting, Abusive language, fine, Threatening, Blackening the face with ink, Banning recreational facilities etc.

Islam and punishment

Islam is a complete code of life that is sent by Almighty Allah through the Angel Gabriel on his last messenger the Prophet Muhammad (P.B.U.H) for the betterment of the individuals. Islam emphasizes moral principles by which we mean ILmul Akhlaq (Ethics). Islam teaches us impartiality and sameness by adopting the straightway (Sirat-e-Mustaqim) and condemns those who go against the rights of others (Haqooq-ul-Ibad). Islam believes in wellbeing of society where the people should live a happy life. Allah has revealed the Holy Quran that gives set of laws and rules for the restraint of people and maintaining peace, those are called “Hudood” and “Qisas” “which is retribution in this world for the offenders. Those who sever these laws will be punished for their wrong doings. But there will be stipulation of complete justice on the Day of decision. Everyone will be treated according to his or her own actions.

For this purpose Allah has sent the last Prophet Muhammad (P.B.U.H) to lead the people on the right path. He is sent as a leader and teacher to guide the people to shun the wrong doing. He is a great reformer for the cosmos; His life is an example for all of his supporters. He always taught to be good, just and to avoid the offences. Even at his last lecture. He emphasizes the right of others and says:

“your lives and property are sacred trust among yourselves. You have rights over your wives and your wives have rights over you. Be faithful to each other and don’t commit sins. No murders committed during the day of unawareness (Jahilayyai) are to be avenged. There is no preference for the Arab over non-Arab. Every Muslim feed and clothe your slaves with such food as you eat. Clothe yourselves. If they commit a fault which you find hard to

forgive, let them go free away and don't treat them harshly. Be kind and just to everyone".

His address us to live a reasonable life. It recommends the maintenance of integrity and equality. The destruction of right's, taking revenge and illegal punishment is harshly forbidden, Islam teaches to forgive others. Muhammad (P.B.U.H) led on perfect life to be emulated by all in fact. Forgiveness is a moral value, which creates environment of union. It is the worth, which makes the learning process effective and interesting. The Quran says:

"Those who shun transgressions and indecencies and whenever they get angry they forgive" (42. al-Shura: 37)

Islam also believes in "Qisas"

Quran says:

"o believers, retaliation are decree for you in bloodshed. A free man for free man, a slave for a slave, and a female for a female. He who is pardoned by his aggrieved brother shall be prosecuted according to usage and shall pay him a liberal fine. This is alleviation from your Lord and mercy. He that transgresses thereafter shall have storm punishment. In retaliation you have a safeguard for your live o men of understanding perchance you will guard yourselves against evil" (2.al-Baqara: 178,179)

The basic doctrine of "Qisas" is reformative, In Islam punishment does not mean to harm anyone and to give pain to anyone but the main purpose of punishment is bring about reform in the society. Therefore punishment is justified for reformative purposes by educationists and not for the satisfaction of one's own ulterior motives. Quran says further:

"If tries parties of believers take up arms against each other, make peace between them. If either of them commits aggression against the other, fight against the aggressors till they submit to Allah is judgment. When they submit, make peace between them in equity and justice, Allah ones the equitable" (49.al- Hujurat: 9)

The teachings of Islam are valuable for all human beings because there is return for good doer and reformative punishment for the lawbreakers. Islam stresses every Muslim to get education because education is the only solution of all the problems. The most famous Muslim scholar, thinker and educationist, Imam Ghazali says:

“Education is the process which enable an individual to distinguish between the true and the false, the good and the bad, the right conduct and the evil doing”.

Muhammad (p.b.u.h) with his children

Muhammad loved his children very much. His companions called him Abu Qasim, after his eldest son’s name, and he liked that. Anas said, “I have never seen anyone more kind towards children than Allah’s Messenger. His youngest son Ibrahim was being suckled in the neighborhood of Medinah, and he would go accompanied by us and enter the house which was frill of smoke, the boy’s foster- father being a blacksmith. He would take him and kiss him and then go back.” And he was then undisputed ruler of the state of Medinah, covering almost the whole of the Arabian Peninsula and extending to the southern border of the Byzantine Empire. Fatimah was his youngest and the only child who survived him. He loved her immensely. Once he said:

“Fatimah is a part of me. He is fact tortures me who tortures her.” (Bukhari, vol: 2, p.32 and Muslim, vol: 2, p.290).

He loved his grandchildren, Hasan and Hussain, very much and often used to play with them. They used to ride on his back and made him run like a horse. Once, as he was carrying Hasan on his shoulders, he said:

“O Allah, I love him so I beseech you to love him.”(Bukhari, vol: 1, p.530 and Muslim, vol: 2, p.282).

Abu Hurairah said:

one day he went out with Allah’s Messenger, who, when he came to Fatimah’s house said, “Is a little chap there? Is a little chap there?” meaning Hasan. In a moment, he came running, and when they had embraced one another, Allah’s Messenger said, “O Allah, I love him, so I beseech you to love him and those who love him.” (Muslim, vol: 2, p.282).

According to Usamah Ibn Zaid, the Prophet used to take Hasan and him and say:

“O Allah, I beseech you to love them, for I love them,” (Bukhari, vol: 1, p. 530)

Usama Ibne Zaid narrated:

“I went to the Prophet one night about something I required and he came out with something under his cloak. When I had finished telling him my business, I asked him what he had under his cloak, and when he opened it I saw

Hasan and Husain on his hips". He then said, "These are my sons and my daughter's sons. O Allah, I love them, so I beseech you to love them and those who love them" (Tirmizi, vol: 2, p. 217).

It is reported by Buraidah that while Allah's Messenger was address in the people, Hasan and Husain came along in red shirts, stumbling as they walked. Allah's Messenger then descended from the pulpit, lifted them and put them in front of him, then said:

"Allah has spoken the Truth in saying, 'Your property and your children are just a temptation.' I looked at these two boys stumbling as they walked, and could not refrain from interrupting my address and lifting them up." (Tirmizi, vol: 2, p. 218) Ibn Abbas said:

When Allah's Messenger was carrying Hasan on his shoulder, a man said, "You have mounted a fine steed, boy." The Prophet said, "And he is a fine rider." (Tirmizi, vol: 2, p. 218)

Anas said that:

when Allah's Messenger was asked which member of his family was dearest to him, he replied, "Hasan and Husain," He used to say to Fatimah, "Call my two sons to me, and then would cuddle them." (Tirmizi, vol: 2. p.218)

Allah's Messenger is reported to have said:

"Hussain belongs to me and I to him. May Allah love him who loves Hussain Hussain is my grandson." (Tirmizi, vol: 2. p.218)

The objectives of the study are;

- i. To investigate the perception of the Holy Quran and Hadith on corporal punishment.
- ii. To find out the causes and effect of corporal punishment on students' performance.
- iii. To provide suggestions for minimizing corporal punishment and to maintain discipline at elementary level

Methodology

The study was descriptive in nature. Questionnaires were prepared for students and teachers to collect their views. The collected data was tabulated, analyzed and interpreted.

Population

All the students studying in elementary public schools of district Peshawar are included in the population of the study.

Sampling

Forty government schools were selected randomly as sample, boys' and girls' student ratio was 67:33 of the sample.

- i. Three students each from 6th, 7th and 8th class were taken randomly from each school.
- ii. Secondly three teachers were also taken randomly from each school.

Analysis of the Data

The collected data was analyzed by percentage and by simple percentage method.

Students' views

Table # 1 Total number of students' Respondents = 360

S #	Statement	Yes	%	No	%
1	Corporal punishment is given in your school	216	60	144	40
2	Corporal punishment is given in your school even on minor mistakes?	76	21%	284	79%
3	Most of students remain absent on a day when a teacher administers a test?	212	59%	148	41%
4	You are punished by coming late or without uniform,	256	71%	104	29%
5	Teacher express anger while giving punishment to a students	233	65%	127	35%
6	You are afraid of corporal punishment	326	91%	34	9%
7	Students dropout is due to corporal punishment	231	64%	129	36%
8	Children with hearing impairment are punished in your school	36	10%	324	90%

In the above statements majority of the students' 60% respondents view that corporal punishment is given in their schools, 79% do not agree with the 2nd statement and small number of the students explained that corporal punishment is given even on minor issues. There is significant association between corporal punishment and absentees on the next day from school. Statement number four shows that a lot of the students are punished by coming late or having no proper uniform. A great number 65% of the students unfolded themselves that their teachers are aggressive at the time of corporal punishment. 91% of the students are scared of such punishment. 64% of the respondents' students view that majority of the students say goodbye to their school by dent of

corporal punishment. 90% of the student revealed that most of the time impaired students are given corporal punishment

Table 2: What types of teacher do you like the most?

Punish severely		Rebuke harshly		Affectionate	
Number.	%age	Number	%age	No.	%age
29	8%	15	4%	316	88%

Table-2 shows that majority 88%of the students liked those teachers who met them with love and affection

Table 3: How do you feel about the teacher after being punished?

Love your teacher more		Start hating your teacher	
Number	%age	Number.	%age
36	10%	324	90%

According to the table no 3 90% students hate those teachers who punished them

Table 4: Maximum punishment is given to you at home, at school or nowhere

At home		At school		Nowhere	
Number.	%age	Number.	%age	No.	%age
103	29%	183	51%	74	20%

According to the data from the table 51% students agreed that maximum punishment is given to them in school.

Table 5: When does your teacher punish you, generally?

Mischief/Disrespect		Moral crimes		Incomplete home work	
Number	%age	No.	%age	Number	%age
83	23%	83	23%	194	54%

The analysis of table shows that 54% students are punished for incomplete home work.

Table 6: Children should be punished to maintain school discipline

Yes		No	
Number	%age	Number.	%age
251	70%	109	30%

According to the table above70% students are in favor of corporal punishment to maintain discipline in school

What other options (alternatives) you think the teacher should use instead of corporal

Punishment. (Students' View)

Teachers should treat the students with love and affection 72%, innovative teaching methods 24%, Teachers, parents meeting 22%, Teachers should advise and guide students 20%, Teachers should give rewards and appreciation to students 20%, Teachers should work hard (16%), Teachers should create positive competition among the students 10%, teachers may come to the class well prepared 78%

Teachers' views: (Respondents 120)

Table 7: What type of punishment is commonly given in your school?

Fine	%	Rebuke	%	Corporal punishment	%
22	18%	30	25%	68	57%

Table-7 shows 57% are in favor of corporal punishment is given in schools, it indicates that majority of teachers were in favor of corporal punishment.

Table 8: If yes, then what type of punishment you will prefer most?

Fine	%	Corporal punishment	%	Re assigning the work	%
21	18%	84	70%	15	12%

Table-9 shows that 70% teachers agreed to use corporal punishment.

Table 8: If not in a favor of corporal punishment why?

Create negative impact on personality	%	Violation of rule	%	No positive encouragement is seen	%
48	40%	9	7%	63	53%

The analysis of the table shows that majority of the teachers see no positive improvement by corporal punishment that is why they are not in favor of such punishment

Table 9: When punishment should be given to the students?

When students misbehave	%	Perform poorly	%	Do not complete assignment	%
23	19%	23	19%	74	62%

Table-9 shows that 62% teachers were in favor of corporal punishment when students do not complete their assignment.

Table 10: After being punished what is the reaction of the student?

Try to reform himself	%	No change in behavior	%	Any other	%
69	57%	30	25%	21	18%

Table-10 shows that after being punished 57% students amended their behavior

Table 11:

Question	Yes	%	No	%
Are you punishing the children according to the philosophy of punishment?	22	18%	98	82%

The analysis of the table shows that 82% teachers do not agree with the statement and are punishing the students without the philosophy of punishment.

Table 12: What is your strategy for maintaining the discipline of your class?

Warning/Advice	%	Fine	%	Corporal Punishment	%
24	20%	26	22%	70	58%

The data analysis from the table shows that 58% teachers were in favor of maintaining discipline through corporal punishment.

Table 13:

Statement/ Question	Yes	%	No	%	To some extents	%
Do you think that corporal punishment make discipline and peaceful atmosphere in the schools?	61	51%	20	17%	38	32%
Should corporal punishment be stopped or minimized?	70	58%	15	13%	35	29%
Corporal punishment affects students' performance	71	59%	24	20%	25	21%
Have you attended any training regarding child psychology?	43	36%	57	48%	20	16%
Students dropout due to corporal punishment	60	50%	40	33%	20	17%

Are you in favor of giving corporal punishment?	75	63 %	13	11 %	32	26%
---	----	------	----	------	----	-----

Over here majority (83%) of the respondents are of the view that classroom discipline is maintained with the help of corporal punishment. Majority of the respondents want to stop awarding corporal punishment however slight punishment may be given. About 90 % of the respondents held corporal punishment responsible for the poor performance of the students. 36% teachers have attended training regarding child psychology, 48% teachers have not attended any training regarding child psychology, while 16% teachers have studied to some extent about child psychology. Here it is clear that majority of the teachers are aware about the children psychology. 50% teachers agreed that students' dropout is due to corporal punishment so majority of the teachers are of the opinion that students' drop out is caused due to corporal punishment. 63% of the teachers agreed to give corporal punishment It means that majority of teachers were in favor of corporal punishment

Table 15: At which level corporal punishment is given more frequently?

Primary	%	Middle	%	High	%
72	60%	36	30%	12	10%

The analysis shows that 60% teachers stated that students of primary level get corporal punishment more frequently

What should be the other alternatives of corporal punishment?

Treating the students with love and affection 27%
 Creating positive competition through rewards 17%,
 Provision of recreational facilities, sports etc. 13%,
 Good parents teacher interaction 12%,
 Advice to the students 11%,
 Use of interesting teaching methods 8%,
 Use of Audiovisual aids 6%,
 Imposition of fine 5%,
 Making groups of good and weak students 8%,
 Teacher training and refresher courses 3%,
 Understanding the student's problem 3%.

Table 16: What type of teacher gives corporal punishment?

Do not know child psychology	%	Lakes command over his subject	%	Emotional	%
31%	44%	30	25%	37	

According to the analysis of the table most of those teachers are awarding corporal punishments who are unaware about the child psychology

Teachers’ suggestions for minimizing corporal punishment

Proper guidance 25%, activity based and joyful teaching methods 20%, Parents teachers meeting 19%, Knowledge of philosophy of punishment 31%, Knowledge of students’ psychology 45%, Treatment of the students with love and affection 30%, Appreciation and rewards as a token of achievement 27%, Giving proper training to the teachers 48%, friendly environment in classroom 33%, Burden on students must be avoided 8%

Why should corporal punishment be minimized?

Improvement of standard of education 35%, Effects on students’ mental capabilities 22%, Lack of confidence 42%, Development of study habits in students 36%, Reduction of students’ phobia 14%, to overcome aggression in students 19%, Control of negative attitude in students (56%), mental relaxation of students 34%, Violation of rules 15%

To which social problems, does corporal punishment lead to?

It leads to moral crimes 27%, It makes students revengeful 12%, Students start misbehaving 23%, Poor parents, teacher and child relationship 44%, Maladjustment in society 51%, Non cooperation of students 17%, Development of aggressive attitude in students 20%, Lack of coordination 34%, Rudeness of students 10%, Corporal punishment leads to crime like gambling, theft etc. 15%

Which Psychological problems, does corporal punishment lead to?

High mental disorders developing in children 40%, Frightening syndrome 20%, Aggressive behavior 17%, Rude behavior 10%, Guilty feelings 9%, Developing an inferiority complex 6%, Feeling ashamed (48%).

Conclusion

Students Response to Corporal Punishment

Majority of the students stated that corporal punishment is given in their schools. 66% students remain absent on the day when teacher administer the test. Students show fear to punishment. They are of the view that physical punishment damages the personality of the child. Dropout is caused by corporal punishment. Students start hating those teachers who punish them. They punished for being not completing the home work and maintaining discipline. They suggest that the students should be treated with love and affection.

Teachers Response to Corporal Punishment

Most of the teachers are in favor of giving corporal punishment. They state that after stopping the corporal punishment they restart it because the students start misbehaving, and ignored studies. The teachers also replied that they are not trained to avoid corporal punishment in their training programs. Teachers are agreeing that students' dropout is due to corporal punishment. After punishment majority of the students amend their behavior. Most of teachers do not attain training regarding child psychology.

Teachers are in favor of maintaining discipline through corporal punishment. They responded that physical penalty is more successful than other types of punishments. Fifty eight percent teachers are interested to stop or minimize corporal punishment. Teachers also suggest that the students should be treated with love and affection. Teachers who use corporal punishment do not know the child psychology. They suggest that the teachers should be properly trained to minimize corporal punishment.

Physical and Psychological Effects

Corporal punishment is a dangerous practice, which can cause physical major or minor injuries. Corporal punishment is also identified as a major factor in the development of aggressive attitude at childhood. It leads to moral crimes, revengefulness, maladjustment, aggressive behavior, feeling ashamed and inferiority complex. Corporal punishment is still a common practice in majority of the public schools.

Lack of Training Regarding Child Personality Development

The study shows that lack of proper training regarding child psychology which creates psychological and social problems, teachers use corporal punishment which is dangerous for the development of child personality.

Recommendations

The following suggestions are based on the key findings and conclusions drawn from qualitative and quantitative assessments during study.

- i. The education department may have clear policy on corporal punishment. Other humiliating treatment may be clearly barred in schools.
- ii. Guidance and counseling committees may be introduced in the schools, to give advice to the teachers about child psychology.
- iii. Training can change the belief of parents and teachers along with teaching alternatives.
- iv. Preference may be given to School based problem solving mechanisms as opposed to encouraging complaints;
- v. The education department may be more influential for the elimination of corporal punishment.
- vi. Provincial departments may issue notification to stop physical punishment in all schools.
- vii. Physical punishment may not be tackled in isolation.
- viii. There is a need to highlight issues such as a lack of school infrastructure and an imbalanced teacher-student ratio which will lead to corporal punishment.

References

- Straus, M. A., & Donnelly, D. A. (1994). Beating the devil out of them: corporal punishment in American families. New York: Lexington Books.*
- Baler, L. (1988). Who's in control? New York: Poseidon Press.*
- Corporal Punishment. (n.d.). CORPORAL PUNISHMENT. Retrieved October 21, 2014, from <http://www.corpun.com/benatar.htm>*
- Dubanoski, R., Inan, M. and Gerkewich, B. (1983). Corporal Punishment In Schools: Myths Problems, and Alternatives. Child Abuse and Neglect, 7 271-278.*
- Erickson, E. (1950). Childhood and Society. New York: W.W. Norton.*
- Kelly, J. (1983). Solving your child's behavior problems: an everyday guide for parents. Toronto: Little, Brown and Company.*

Tahdhīb al Afkār An Analysis of Corporal Punishment Jan-June, 2016

K, Walt. (1991). Discipline for Character Development. Alabama:R.E.P. Books.

Butler, Semual.(1903). The Way of All Flesh: United Kingdom: Grant Richards.

Oxford Dictionary. (1995). Oxford University Press.

Bukhari, vol: 1, P.530

Bukhari, vol: 2, P.32

Muslim, vol: 2, P.282,290

Tirmizi, vol: 2, P.217,218

The encyclopedia American.(1994). Danbuiy: Grolier Incoomted, vol-8.

Encyclopedia of Secrah, Vol-II. 1986.

Annual Statistical Report of Government Schools. (2013-14). Education Management

Information System Elementary and Secondary Education. Govt. of KPK

Cohen, C. P. (1984). Freedom from corporal punishment: One of the human rights of children.

New York Law School Human Rights Annual, Volume II, Part 1

Global Report. (2008). Ending Legalized Violence against Children. P .23

Maryam, R.,(2008-09). Research thesis of M.Ed. Sarsayed College of Education Kohat.

UNESCO (2009). EFA, Monitoring Report Education for All, Overview. Paris

Waqas, M. (2010). Towards Bright Future. Society for the Protection of the Rights of the Child. (SPARC)

<http://www.answers.com/topic/prevalence>

www.moe.gov.pk

www.religioustolerance.org/spanking.htm. Corporal punishment of children (spanking).

www.silcon.com/~ptave/hands.htm. Corporal punishment to children's hands.

www.sparc.pk